Social Solidarity in Slovenian through the perspective of parking violations in spaces reserved for disabled people – analysis of situation in Ljubljana

Ljubljana, 19 October 2023

Assoc. prof. dr. Aleš Bučar Ručman
Faculty of Criminal Justice and Security, University of Maribor
Selected excuses that were given to the municipal wardens by offenders after parking on parking spaces for the disabled people.

»But I did not hinder anyone.«

»Where is the sign that prohibits parking for non-disabled people here?«

»But it’s just for 5 minutes.«

»I can park here for 5 minutes since I’m a journalist!«

»Disabled people also occupy sidewalks and other parking spots and they don’t get the ticket.«

»If the place was crowded, I wouldn’t park here.«

»But I turned on all four signal lights!«

»I do have the card for disabled people, but I’ve given it to my grandmother.«
PARK YOUR EXCUSES ELSEWHERE!
Not on spaces reserved for the disabled people.

PROJECT

RESEARCH
EXPERT MEETINGS
PUBLIC AWARENESS CAMPAIGN

PARTNERS

SUPPORTERS

Raziskovalna dejavnost in projekt Parkraj izgovorite drugam (ne na mesta, rezervirana za invalide) sta podpita s strani Javne agencije Republike Slovenije za varnost prometa in Mestne občine Ljubljana.
RQ

• How do people respect the (moral & formal) norm, that parking at spaces reserved for disabled people is acceptable only for disabled badge holders?

• Who is parking at spaces reserved for disabled people and what is happening at this parking spaces?

• How can we connect this to other social phenomena, what can be concluded about the solidarity and anomie in Slovene society?
FIELD RESEARCH 2015, 2018, 2021

- **DAY 1**: 17 April 2015; Friday; time: 14.00-18.00; weather: cloudy, a little rain (drizzle); 14°C
- **DAY 2**: 18 April 2015; Saturday; time: 10.00-14.00; rainy all day; 4°C
- **Day 3**: 21 April 2015; Tuesday; time: 14.00-18.00; sunny, 23°C

- Pre-research observation of parking spaces (28/3/2015; 11/4/2015);
- Training of supervisors (5) => training of observers => conducting a research
- Checking legal grounds at Information commissioner office; getting approval for research at private places
OBSERVED LOCATIONS

Shopping centres/malls, streets in the centre of Ljubljana, Community Health Centre

PARK YOUR EXCUSES ELSEWHERE!
Not on spaces reserved for the disabled people.
Raziskovalna dejavnost in projekt Parkiraj izgovore drugam (ne na mestu, rezervirana za invalide) sta podpira s strani Javne agencije Republike Slovenije za varnost prometa in Mestne občine Ljubljana.
Raziskovalna dejavnost in projekt Parkiraj izgovore drugam (ne na mestu, rezervirana za invalide) sta podprta s strani Javne agencije Republike Slovenije za varnost prometa in Mestne občine Ljubljana.

OVER 100 NEWS STORIES IN ALL NATIONAL MEDIA IN SLOVENIA

http://parkiraj-izgovore.si/

PUBLIC AWARENESS CAMPAIGN
Video campaign
Video broadcasted on Slovenian national TV (December 2017-January 2018)

No! It only says what you aren't allowed to do.
Ob mednarodnem dnevu invalidov, ki ga obeležujemo 3. decembra, bodo Fakulteta za varnostne vede, Javna agencija RS za varnost prometa in Mestna občina Ljubljana nadaljevali s kampanjo in spremljajočimi aktivnostmi »Parkiraj izgovore drugam! Ne na mesta, rezervirana za invalide«, ki vključuje tako ozaveščanje širše javnosti o neopraščenosti in posledicah parkiranja na mestih rezerviranih za invalide, strokovne posvete in tudi poostren nadzor nad neupravičenim parkiranjem. Kampanji se je pridružilo kar 24 slovenskih občin, od tega vseh 11 mestnih občin.
Representatives of Slovenian Road Traffic Agency, the City of Ljubljana, Municipal wardens, Slovenian Police & support organizations
Public event for young drivers & experiencing difficulties & discussion with disabled peers

15. 10. 2023
RESEARCH ACTIVITIES

• Collection of data in 2015, 2018 and 2021 => Analysis of data
• Publication (Research reports 2015, 2018; paper)

• Presentation of research & project abroad
  • Teesside University, UK (2018)
  • Tsukuba University, Japan (2018)
  • University of Malta, Malta (2019)
  • Nihon University, Tokyo, Japan (2022)
Research (2015 V. 2018) (before/after awareness campaign)

observers: 62 + 2 supervisors

Time:
- 9 October 2018 15.00-18.00 (3 h)
- 10 October 2018 15.00-18.00 (3 h)
- 11 October 2018 15.00-18.00 (3 h)
- 12 October 2018 15.00-18.00 (3 h)

Locations: the most frequently used locations in 2018

Number of parking spaces 43 (in 2015 42)
- Shopping centre BTC
- Centre of the city
- Shopping centre SUPERNOVA
Conclusion 2018

Violations in 2015 vs 2018

58% DECREASE OF VIOLATIONS

2015

12h

n = 126
n = 302
Raziskovalna dejavnost in projekt Parkiraj izgovore drugam (ne na mestu, rezervirana za invalide) sta podpira s strani Javne agencije Republike Slovenije za varnost prometa in Mestne občine Ljubljana.

15. 10. 2023

**DISABILITY CARD**

57% YES

43% NO

n=296
Raziskovalna dejavnost in projekt Parkiraj izgovore drugam (ne na mesta, rezervirana za invalide) sta podprta s strani Javne agencije Republike Slovenije za varnost prometa in Mestne občine Ljubljana.

15. 10. 2023

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Disability Cards</th>
<th>Violations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>161 (35%)</td>
<td>302 (65%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>126 (43%)</td>
<td>170 (57%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2015 vs 2018

PARK YOUR EXCUSES ELSEWHERE!
Not on spaces reserved for the disabled people.
Raziskovalna dejavnost in projekt Parkiraj izgovore drugam (ne na mesta, rezervirana za invalide) sta podjeta s strani Javne agencije Republike Slovenije za varnost prometa in Mestne občine Ljubljana.

PARK YOUR EXCUSES ELSEWHERE!
Not on spaces reserved for the disabled people.
ESTIMATED AGE OF DRIVERS

- **Disability Card**
  - LESS THAN 30: 1%
  - 30-50 years: 26%
  - OVER 50: 28%

- **Without Disability Card**
  - LESS THAN 30: 5%
  - 30-50 years: 27%
  - OVER 50: 12%

*Note: n=257*
ESTIMATED AGE OF DRIVERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2018</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LESS THAN 30</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>-11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-50 years</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>-2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OVER 50</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>+11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

n=291  n=114
BEHAVIOUR OF DRIVERS

VIOLATORS

Stayed in the car: 29%
Stayed near the car: 44%
Left the car: 28%

Disability Card Holders

Stayed in the car: 6%
Stayed near the car: 5%
Left the car: 89%

Not on spaces reserved for the disabled people.
### DURATION OF VIOLATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DURATION OF PARKING VIOLATION (IN MINUTES)</th>
<th>DISABILITY CARD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LESS THAN 5 MINUTES</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 TO 10 MINUTES</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 - 15 MINUTES</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 - 20 MINUTES</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 - 25 MINUTES</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 - 30 MINUTES</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 - 35 MINUTES</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MORE THAN 35 MINUTES</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DURATION OF VIOLATION:**

- **79%**
**VEHICLE VALUE**

*Vehicle value was estimated by Stojan Renčelj, court expert in the field of car engineering*

- **0 - 1000 €** (14.06%)
- **1001 - 3000 €** (22.81%)
- **3001 - 5000 €** (19.06%)
- **5001 - 7000 €** (11.68%)
- **7001 - 9000 €** (10.94%)
- **9001 - 11000 €** (5.94%)
- **11001 - 13000 €** (4.39%)
- **13001 - 15000 €** (3.13%)
- **15001 - 17000 €** (1.25%)
- **17001 - 19000 €** (2.81%)
- **19001 - 21000 €** (0.94%)
- **21001 - 23000 €** (0.31%)
- **23001 - 25000 €** (0.63%)
- **25001 - 27000 €** (0.94%)
- **27001 - 29000 €** (0.94%)
- **29001 - 31000 €** (0.94%)
- **31001 - 40000 €** (0.94%)
- **40001 + €** (0.94%)

**PERCENTAGE OF THE VIOLATORS**

*VEHICLE VALUE IN €*

n=332
... AND THEN RESEARCH IN 2021 (preliminary results)

- 3-4 year after the campaign
- 1.5 years into COVID-19 pandemic (schools bullying, suicides, political discourse ...)

DISABILITY CARD

- YES 28% (N = 111)
- NO 72% (N = 280)
Raziskovalna dejavnost in projekt Parkiraj izgovore drugam (ne na mestu, rezervirana za invalide) sta podpira s strani Javne agencije Republike Slovenije za varnost prometa in Mestne občine Ljubljana.

**CF. 2015 v. 2018 v. 2021**

![Disability Card Comparison Chart]

- **2015**
  - YES: 161
  - NO: 302

- **2018**
  - YES: 126
  - NO: 170

- **2021**
  - YES: 111
  - NO: 280

- % of YES in:
  - 2015: 65.2%
  - 2018: 43%
  - 2021: 72%
Locations and % of violation 2015, 2018, 2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2018</th>
<th>2021</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BTC 2. nadstropje</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BTC-parkirna pritličje</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drama</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BTC Hala A</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metelkova ZD</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miklošičeva</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muller BTC</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rimska c.</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rudnik Supernova</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VIOLATIONS WHEN NONRESERVED PARKING SPACES ARE FREE

- ALL SPACES ARE OCCUPIED
  - 2015: 75.3%
  - 2018: 37.6%
  - 2021: 80%
  - n=275

- 1-3 FREE NONRESERVED SPACES
  - 2015: 17.5%
  - 2018: 20.8%
  - 2021: 14.5%
  - n=125

- MORE THAN 3 FREE NONRESERVED SPACES
  - 2015: 7.3%
  - 2018: 41.6%
  - 2021: 5.4%
  - n=276

15. 10. 2023
Conclusions

Lack of solidarity, the loosening of social bonds and missing mutual respect and support for fundamental rights of disabled people can be seen in:

• The high level of unjustified parking in reserved spaces (63% (2015); 43% (2018) and 2021 (72%)
• High level of drivers who remained in or near their vehicles,
• High degree (29% (2015); 62% (2018); 20% (2021) of violations occurring even when there was at least one unoccupied non-reserved space available
Thank you for your attention!

Questions? Comments...